

## Haggadah Seminar Sippur: How Do We Remember?

<b>Pesach Haggadah in Maggid: Avadim Hayinu</b>	<b>הגדה במגיד: עבדים היינו</b>
<p>We were slaves to Pharaoh in Egypt, and the Lord, our God, took us out from there with a strong hand and with an outstretched arm. If the Holy One, blessed be He, had not taken our fathers out of Egypt, then we, our children and our children's children would have remained enslaved to Pharaoh in Egypt. Even if all of us were wise, all of us understanding, all of us knowledgeable in Torah, we would still be obligated to discuss Yetziyat Mitzrayim; and everyone who discusses Yetziyat Mitzrayim at length is praiseworthy.</p>	<p>עֲבָדִים הָיִינוּ לְפָרְעָה בְּמִצְרַיִם, וַיּוֹצֵיאֵנוּ ה' אֱלֹהֵינוּ מִשָּׁם בְּיָד חֲזָקָה וּבְזֵרַע נְטוּיָה. וְאֵלֹהֵינוּ לֹא הוֹצִיא הַקְּדוֹשׁ בְּרוּךְ הוּא אֶת אֲבוֹתֵינוּ מִמִּצְרַיִם, הָרִי אֲנֵנוּ וּבְנֵינוּ וּבְנֵי בְנֵינוּ מִשְׁעֲבָדִים הָיִינוּ לְפָרְעָה בְּמִצְרַיִם. וְאִפְּלוּ כָּלֵנוּ חֲכָמִים כָּלֵנוּ נְבוֹנִים כָּלֵנוּ זְקֵנִים כָּלֵנוּ יוֹדְעִים אֶת הַתּוֹרָה מִצְוָה עָלֵינוּ לְסַפֵּר בִּיציאת מצרים. וְכָל הַמְרַבֵּה לְסַפֵּר בִּיציאת מצרים הֵרִי זֶה מְשֻׁבָּח.</p>

<b>Pesach Haggadah in Maggid: Rabban Gamliel</b>	<b>הגדה במגיד: רבן גמליאל</b>
<p>Rabban Gamliel used to say: Whoever does not discuss the following three things on Pesach has not fulfilled his obligation: Pesach, Matzah and Maror...In every generation a person is obligated to regard himself as if he had come out of Egypt, as it is said: "You shall tell your child on that day, it is because of this that the Lord did for me when I left Egypt." The Holy One, blessed be He, redeemed not only our fathers from Egypt, but He redeemed also us with them, as it is said: "It was us that He brought out from there, so that He might bring us to give us the land that He swore to our fathers." Thus it is our duty to thank, to laud, to praise, to glorify, to exalt, to adore, to bless, to elevate, and to honor the One who did all these miracles for our fathers and for us. He took us from slavery to freedom, from sorrow to joy, and from mourning to festivity, and from deep darkness to great light and from bondage to redemption. Let us therefore recite before Him a new song, Praise God!</p>	<p>רַבֵּן גַּמְלִיאֵל הָיָה אוֹמֵר: כָּל שֶׁלֹּא אָמַר שְׁלֹשָׁה דְבָרִים אֵלֶּיךָ בַּפֶּסַח, לֹא יֵצֵא יָדָי חֲזוּבָתוֹ, וְאֵלֹהֵינוּ הֵן: פֶּסַח, מַצָּה, וּמְרֹר...בְּכָל-דּוֹר וְדוֹר חַיֵּב אָדָם לְרַאוֹת אֶת-עֲצָמוֹ כְּאִלּוּ הוּא יֵצֵא מִמִּצְרַיִם, שְׁנֵאמַר: וְהִגַּדְתָּ לְבִנְךָ בַּיּוֹם הַהוּא לֵאמֹר, בְּעֵבֹר זֶה עָשָׂה ה' לִי בְּצֵאתִי מִמִּצְרַיִם. לֹא אֶת-אֲבוֹתֵינוּ בְּלִבָּד גָּאֵל הַקְּדוֹשׁ בְּרוּךְ הוּא, אֲלֵא אַף אוֹתָנוּ גָּאֵל עִמָּהֶם, שְׁנֵאמַר: וְאוֹתָנוּ הוֹצִיא מִשָּׁם, לְמַעַן הֵבִיא אוֹתָנוּ, לְתֵת לָנוּ אֶת-הָאָרֶץ אֲשֶׁר נִשְׁבַּע לְאֲבוֹתֵינוּ. לְפִיכֵךְ אֲנַחֲנוּ חַיִּים לְהוֹדוֹת, לְהַלֵּל, לְשַׁבַּח, לְפָאֵר, לְרוֹמֵם, לְהַדָּר, לְבָרֵךְ, לְעֹלָה וּלְקַלֵּס לְמִי שֶׁעָשָׂה לְאֲבוֹתֵינוּ וּלְנוּ אֶת-כָּל-הַנִּסִּים הָאֵלֶּיךָ: הוֹצִיאָנוּ מֵעֲבָדוֹת לְחֵירוֹת מִיָּגוֹן לְשִׂמְחָה, וּמֵאֲבֵל לְיוֹם טוֹב, וּמֵאֲפֵלָה לְאוֹר גְּדוֹל, וּמִשְׁעָבוֹד לְגִאֲלוֹה. וְנֵאמַר לְפָנָיו שִׁירָה חֲדָשָׁה: הַלְלוּקָה.</p>

<b>Panim Yafot on Shemot 35 (1)</b>	<b>פנים יפות שמות פרק לה, אות א</b>
<p>"It is because of what God did <i>for me</i>":...The miracles happened for the purpose of telling the story.</p>	<p>כמ"ש בסוף פ' בא בפסוק [יג, ה] בעבור זה עשה ה' לי וגו'...והיינו שהניסים לא נעשו אלא בשביל הסיפור.</p>

Chiddushei HaGrach on Pesachim 116.	חידושי הגר"ח פסחים קטז.
<p>Every night there is a mitzvah of remembering Yetziyat Mitzrayim, so what is added on the night of Pesach with the mitzvah of telling the story of Yetziyat Mitzrayim that is not included in the year round obligation of memory? It seems that there are three differences between zechirah (year round) and sippur (only on Pesach): 1. In order to uphold the mitzvah of zechirah, a person only needs to remember to himself. But for sippur, he must tell the story to another in the form of questions and answers, as it is written "When your son asks you, you will say to him" and "You shall tell to your child". In the Haggadah, the son asks "Why is this different?" and the father answers, "Avadim hayinu". And the halacha is that even if a person is alone, he still needs to ask himself and answer, "Avadim hayinu" in the way that he would tell another. 2. In sippur, a person must tell all of the falls-- he must start with disgrace and end with praise. But in order to fulfill the mitzvah of zechirah, it is sufficient to just remember the exodus [the praise]. 3. In sippur, a person must make mention of the mitzvot of that same night, as it says in the Mishnah, "Rabban Gamliel said that anyone who does not mention three things on Pesach does not fulfill his obligation, and these are they: Pesach, Matzah, and Maror".</p>	<p>הנה בכל לילה יש מצוה של זכירת יציאת מצרים, וא"כ מה נתוסף בליל פסח במצות סיפור יציאת מצרים שאין בזכירה של כל השנה. ונראה לומר, שיש ג' חילוקים בין המצוה של זכירת יציאת מצרים להמצוה של סיפור יציאת מצרים: (א) לקיים מצות זכירה אין צריך אלא להזכיר לעצמו יצי"מ, אבל בסיפור יציאת מצרים המצוה היא לספר לאחר דרך שאלה ותשובה כדכתיב "והיה כי ישאלך בנך וגו' ואמרת אליו" וכדכתיב "והגדת לבנך וגו'". ובהגדה הבן שואל מה נשתנה והאב משיב עבדים היינו, וההלכה היא שאפילו אם אחד לבדו צריך לשאול לעצמו ולומר עבדים היינו כדרך סיפור לאחר. (ב) בסיפור צריך לספר כל ההשתלשלות, וצריך להתחיל בגנות ולסיים בשבח, ולקיים מצות זכירה סגי בזכירת יציאת מצרים לחוד. (ג) מצוה לספר טעמי המצוות של אותו הלילה, כמ"ש במשנה (פסחים קטז ע"א) רבן גמליאל היה אומר כל שלא אמר שלשה דברים אלו בפסח לא יצא ידי חובתו, ואלו הן פסח מצה ומרור, פסח על שום מה וכו' מצה על שום וכו' מרור על שום וכו'.</p>

Rambam Mishneh Torah Chametz U'Matzah 7:1-3	רמב"ם משנה תורה חמץ ומצה ז:א-ג
<p>1. It is a positive commandment of the Torah to relate the miracles and wonders wrought for our ancestors in Egypt on the night of the fifteenth of Nisan, as [Exodus 13:3] states: "Remember this day, on which you left Egypt," just as [Exodus 20:8] states: "Remember the Sabbath day." From where [is it derived that this mitzvah is to be fulfilled on] the night of the fifteenth? The Torah teaches [Exodus 13:8]: "And you shall tell your son on that day, saying: 'It is because of this...'" [implying that the mitzvah is to be fulfilled] when matzah and maror are placed before you...</p> <p>2..A father should teach his son according to the son's knowledge: How is this applied? If the son is young or foolish, he should tell him: "My son, in Egypt, we were all</p>	<p>א מצות עשה של תורה לספר בנסים ונפלאות שנעשו לאבותינו במצרים בליל חמשה עשר בניסן שנאמר זכור את היום הזה אשר יצאתם ממצרים כמו שנאמר זכור את יום השבת. ומנין שבלייל חמשה עשר תלמוד לומר והגדת לבנך ביום ההוא לאמר בעבור זה בשעה שיש מצה ומרור מונחים לפניך...</p> <p>ב...לפי דעתו של בן אביו מלמדו. כיצד אם היה קטן או טיפש אומר לו בני כולנו היינו עבדים כמו שפחה זו או כמו עבד זה במצרים ובליילה הזה</p>

<p>slaves like this maidservant or this slave. On this night, the Holy One, Blessed be He, redeemed us and took us out to freedom.” If the son is older and wise, he should inform him what happened to us in Egypt and the miracles wrought for us by Moshe, our teacher; everything according to the son's knowledge.</p> <p>3. He should make changes on this night so that the children will see and will [be motivated to] ask: "Why is this night different from all other nights?" until he replies to them: "This and this occurred; this and this took place." What changes should be made? He should give them roasted seeds and nuts; the table should be taken away before they eat; matzot should be snatched from each other and the like...</p>	<p>פדה אותנו הקב"ה ויוציאנו לחירות. ואם היה הבן גדול וחכם מודיעו מה שאירע לנו במצרים ונסים שנעשו לנו ע"י משה רבינו הכל לפי דעתו של בן:</p> <p>ג וצריך לעשות שינוי בלילה הזה כדי שיראו הבנים וישאלו ויאמרו מה נשתנה הלילה הזה מכל הלילות עד שישב להם ויאמר להם כך וכך אירע להם קליות ואגוזים ועוקרים השולחן מלפניהם קודם שיאכלו וחוטפין מצה זה מיד זה וכיוצא בדברים האלו...</p>
--	--

**Alina Tugend, *Why People Remember Negative Events More Than Positive Ones (Praise Is Fleeting, but Brickbats We Recall): The New York Times*<sup>1</sup>**

My sisters and I have often marveled that the stories we tell over and over about our childhood tend to focus on what went wrong...But it turns out we're typical. "This is a general tendency for everyone," said Clifford Nass, a professor of communication at Stanford University. "Some people do have a more positive outlook, but almost everyone remembers negative things more strongly and in more detail." There are physiological as well as psychological reasons for this. "The brain handles positive and negative information in different hemispheres," said Professor Nass, who co-authored "The Man Who Lied to His Laptop: What Machines Teach Us About Human Relationships" (Penguin 2010). Negative emotions generally involve more thinking, and the information is processed more thoroughly than positive ones, he said. Thus, we tend to ruminate more about unpleasant events — and use stronger words to describe them — than happy ones...[T]his is all rather depressing. There is an upside, however. Just knowing this may help us better deal with the bad stuff that will inevitably happen...As Professor Baumeister, [a professor of social psychology at Florida State University] note[s] in his study, "Many good events can overcome the psychological effects of a bad one." In fact, the authors quote a ratio of five goods for every one bad. That's a good reminder that we all need to engage in more acts of kindness — toward others and ourselves — to balance out the world.

**Oliver Sacks, *Musicophilia* (Chapter 29)**

Most patients with dementia are not specially gifted [musically], and yet—remarkably, and almost without exception—they retain their musical powers and tastes even when most

<sup>1</sup><http://www.nytimes.com/2012/03/24/your-money/why-people-remember-negative-events-more-than-positive-ones.html>

other mental powers have been severely compromised. They can recognize music and respond to it emotionally even when little else can get through. Hence the great importance of access to music, whether through concerts, recorded music, or formal music therapy. Sometimes music therapy is communal, sometimes individual. It is astonishing to see mute, isolated, confused individuals warm to music, recognize it as familiar, and start to sing, start to bond with a therapist. It is even more astonishing to see a dozen deeply demented people—all in worlds or nonworlds of their own, seemingly incapable of any coherent reactions, let alone interactions—and how they respond to the presence of a music therapist who begins to play music in front of them. There is a sudden attention: a dozen pairs of distracted eyes fasten on the player. Torpid patients become alert and aware; agitated ones grow calmer. That it may be possible to gain the attention of such patients and hold it for minutes at a time is itself remarkable...Familiar music acts as a sort of Proustian mnemonic, eliciting emotions and associations that had been long forgotten, giving the patient access once again to moods and memories, thoughts and worlds that had seemingly been completely lost. Faces assume expression as the old music is recognized and its emotional power felt. One or two people, perhaps, start to sing along, others join them, and soon the entire group—many of them virtually speechless before—is singing together, as much as they are able. “Together” is a crucial term, for a sense of community takes hold, and these patients who seemed incorrigibly isolated by their disease and dementia are able, at least for a while, to recognize and bond with others.

**Rabbi Jonathan Sacks, *We Are What We Remember: Ki Tavo 5776***

In the past few years, a spate of books has appeared in the United States asking whether the American story is still being told, still being taught to children, still framing a story that speaks to all its citizens, reminding successive generations of the battles that had to be fought for there to be a “new birth of freedom”, and the virtues needed for liberty to be sustained. The sense of crisis in each of these works is palpable, and though the authors come from very different positions in the political spectrum, their thesis is roughly the same: If you forget the story, you will lose your identity. There is such a thing as a national equivalent of Alzheimer’s. Who we are depends on what we remember, and in the case of the contemporary West, a failure of collective memory poses a real and present danger to the future of liberty. Jews have told the story of who we are for longer and more devotedly than any other people on the face of the earth. That is what makes Jewish identity so rich and resonant. In an age in which computer and smartphone memories have grown so fast, from kilobytes to megabytes to gigabytes, while human memories have become so foreshortened, there is an important Jewish message to humanity as a whole. You can’t delegate memory to machines. You have to renew it regularly and teach it to the next generation. Winston Churchill said: “The longer you can look back, the further you can see forward.” Or to put it slightly differently: Those who tell the story of their past have already begun to build their children’s future.