

Ysoscher Katz  
Spring, 2020

Darkhei Noam's virtual minyan is based on the [psak of Rabbi Eliezer Melamed](#) and other prominent Israeli *poskim*. Mourners recite Kaddish Yatom and Kaddish D'rabbanan, but they do not say Barchu and Kedusha and also do not do Chazarat Hasha"tz.

The halakhic validity of a zoom minyan for **full** tefillah betzibur (ie., including Barchu, Kedusha and Chazarat Hasha"tz) hinges on two halakhic questions: 1) Do the people who constitute the minyan have to be in the same location, or is it sufficient for them to see each other from separate rooms? 2) Assuming that it is enough if the members of the quorum see one another, and they don't have to physically be in the same room, is virtual seeing considered "real," halakhically?

The first question is already discussed in the *Shulchan Aruch*. While most *poskim* conclude that the group needs to be physically together, there is a minority opinion that believes that visual proximity is sufficient, i.e., that the quorum is not required to be in the same room. On the other hand, the question about the halakhic status of virtual reality is new. Earlier *poskim* say very little about it (for obvious reasons). Halakha has begun to explore this issue recently. The discussion, however, is in its infancy.

A Zoom-like minyan (virtual video-meeting) would only be valid if we decide affirmatively on both questions: that the *kahal* does not have to be in the same room as long as the members can see each other, and that virtual seeing is halakhically "real."

Rabbi Melamed chose not to take a stand on these questions. He therefore is not able to permit a full *tefillat tzibbur* in a Zoom minyan. A minyan is obligatory for *devarim shebikdusha* such as Barchu and Chazarat Hasha"tz, and a virtual minyan may not satisfy that requirement. However, when it comes to Kaddish, his ruling is different. Rabbi Melamed sees Kaddish as something that approximates, but is not actually, a *davar shebikdusha*. As such, he believes, Kaddish can be recited with a virtual minyan.