



THE GREAT SYNAGOGUE
SYDNEY
ק"ק בית ישראל

Shabbat Hagadol Drasha 5780

Leaning on Seder Night – Redeeming the bitterness

Rabbi Dr Benjamin Elton

1. Rambam, Laws of Chametz and Matza

אֲפִלוּ עֲנִי שְׁבִי שְׂרָאֵל לֹא יֹאכַל עַד שְׁיִסֵּב... וְאִימְתִי צְרִיכִין הַסִּיבָה בְּשַׁעַת אֲכִילַת כֶּזַיִת מִצָּה וּבְשַׁתִּיט אֲרַבְעָה כּוֹסוֹת הָאֵלוּ.

Even a poor person among Israel should not eat until he reclines... And when do we need reclining? At the time of eating a *kazayit* of matsa and drinking these four cups.

2. Talmud Bavli Pesachim 108a

וּאִפִּילוּ עֲנִי שְׁבִי שְׂרָאֵל לֹא יֹאכַל עַד שִׁיִּסֵּב: אֵיתָמַר מִצָּה צְרִיךְ הַסִּיבָה מְרֹר אֵין צְרִיךְ הַסִּיבָה יֵין אֵיתָמַר מִשְׁמִיָּה דְרַב נַחֲמָן צְרִיךְ הַסִּיבָה וְאֵיתָמַר מִשְׁמִיָּה דְרַב נַחֲמָן אֵין צְרִיךְ הַסִּיבָה וְלֹא פְּלִיגִי הָא בְּתַרְתִּי כְּסִי קִמְאִי הָא בְּתַרְתִּי כְּסִי בְּתַרְאִי אִמְרִי לֵה לֵהאִי גִיסָא וְאִמְרִי לֵה לֵהאִי גִיסָא אִמְרִי לֵה לֵהאִי גִיסָא תְּרִי כְּסִי בְּתַרְאִי לֹא בְּעוּ הַסִּיבָה מֵאִי דְהוּהּ הוּהּ וְאִמְרִי לֵה לֵהאִי גִיסָא אֲדַרְבֵּה תְּרִי כְּסִי בְּתַרְאִי בְּעוּ הַסִּיבָה הֵיא שְׁעַתָּא דְקָא הוּא חִירוֹת תְּרִי כְּסִי בְּתַרְאִי לֹא בְּעוּ הַכִּי אִיִּדִי וְאִיִּדִי בְּעוּ הַסִּיבָה

We learned in the mishna that **even the poorest of Jews should not eat until he reclines. It was stated** that *amora'im* discussed the requirement to recline. Everyone agrees that **matza requires reclining**, i.e., one must recline when eating *matza*, and **bitter herbs do not require reclining**. With regard to **wine, it was stated in the name of Rav Nahman** that wine **requires reclining, and it was also stated in the name of Rav Nahman** that wine **does not require reclining**. The Gemara explains: **And** these two statements **do not disagree** with each other: **This** statement is referring **to the first two cups, and that** statement is referring **to the last two cups**. However, it was not clear which two cups require reclining according to Rav Nahman. **Some say the explanation in this manner and some say it in that manner**. The Gemara elaborates: **Some say it in this manner, that the first two cups require reclining, as it is now**

that freedom begins. Since reclining is a sign of freedom, while discussing the exodus from Egypt it is appropriate to drink while reclining. By contrast, the **last two cups do not require reclining**, because **what was already was.** In other words, by this point one has completed the discussion of the Exodus and has reached the latter stages of the seder. **And some say it in that manner** and claim that **on the contrary, the last two cups require reclining**, as it is **at that time that there is freedom.** However, the **first two cups do not require reclining, as one still says: We were slaves.** The Gemara concludes: **Now that it was stated so, and it was stated so**, i.e., there are two conflicting opinions and it cannot be proven which two cups require reclining, both **these** sets of cups **and those require reclining.**

3. Haggadah

מְרוֹר זֶה שְׂאֵנוֹ אוֹכְלִים, עַל שׁוֹם מָה? עַל שׁוֹם שְׂמֵרְרוּ הַמִּצְרִים אֶת־חַיֵּי אֲבוֹתֵינוּ בְּמִצְרַיִם שְׂנֵאָמַר:
וַיִּמְרְרוּ אֶת חַיֵּיהֶם בְּעֵבֶדָה קָשָׁה, בְּחֶמֶר וּבִלְבָנִים וּבְכָל־עֲבָדָה בַּשָּׂדֶה אֶת כָּל עֲבָדְתָם אֲשֶׁר עָבְדוּ בָהֶם
בְּפָרֶךְ

This *marror* [bitter greens] that we are eating, for the sake of what [is it]? For the sake [to commemorate] that the Egyptians embittered the lives of our ancestors in Egypt, as it is stated "And they made their lives bitter with hard service, in mortar and in brick, and in all manner of service in the field; in all their service, wherein they made them serve with rigor."

4. Shulchan Aruch 475:1

נוטל מצה שלישית ובוצע ממנה וכורכה עם המרור וטובלה בחרוסת: הגה ויש אומרים דאין לטובלו וכן הוא במנהגים וכן ראיתי נוהגין: ואומר זכר למקדש כהלל ואוכלם ביחד בהסיב'

Take from the third matza and make a sandwich with the marror and dip it in charoset (Rema: some say not to dip it, as in Minhagim [by R Isaac Turnau c. 1400] and I have observed that this is the custom. Say 'we do this in memory of the Temple, just like Hillel did', and we eat it together while leaning.

5. Tur 475

כתב אחי ה"ר יחיאל ז"ל מספקא לי בכריכה אי בעי היסיבה כיון דמרור לא בעי היסיבה ובעל המנהיג כתב דבעי היסיבה בעבור המצה שבאה זכר לחירות

My bother Rabbi Yechiel wrote that he was uncertain if korech required leaning or not, since Marror does not require leaning. The author of the Manhig (R Avraham ben Natan, thirteenth century) wrote that it requires leaning, since the matza comes as a commemoration of freedom.

Hebrew texts and some translations from Sefaria.