

GEMARA. Does not the incident¹ come as a contradiction.² There is a lacuna, and it should be taught thus: But if he wishes to be strict with himself, he may do so, and it does not constitute presumption, and so it also happened that THEY BROUGHT COOKED FOOD TO R. JOHANAN B. ZAKKAI TO TASTE, AND TWO DATES AND A PAIL OF WATER TO R. GAMALIEL [27a] AND THEY SAID, 'BRING THEM UP TO THE SUKKAH', BUT WHEN THEY GAVE TO R. ZADOK FOOD LESS THAN THE BULK OF AN EGG, HE TOOK IT IN A TOWEL, ATE IT OUTSIDE THE SUKKAH, AND DID NOT SAY THE BENEDICTION AFTER IT. But if it was the bulk of an egg, must he needs [eat it in] the *Sukkah*? Should we say that this is a refutation of R. Joseph and Abaye?³—Perhaps [it means that] less than the bulk of an egg does not necessitate washing of the hands⁴ and the benediction,⁵ but if it was the bulk of an egg, it necessitates washing of the hands and the benediction.⁶

MISHNAH. R. ELIEZER SAID, A MAN IS OBLIGED TO EAT FOURTEEN MEALS IN THE SUKKAH,⁷ ONE ON EACH DAY AND ONE ON EACH NIGHT. THE SAGES HOWEVER SAY, THERE IS NO FIXED NUMBER⁸ EXCEPT ON THE FIRST NIGHT OF THE FESTIVAL ALONE.⁹ R. ELIEZER SAID IN ADDITION, IF A MAN DID NOT EAT IN THE SUKKAH ON THE FIRST NIGHT OF THE FESTIVAL, HE MAY MAKE UP FOR IT ON THE LAST NIGHT OF THE FESTIVAL,¹⁰ WHILE THE SAGES SAY, THERE IS NO COM-

opinion that the benediction after the meal, and eating in a *Sukkah* apply only to a full meal in agreement with R. Judah's interpretation of Deut. VIII, 10 (cf. Ber. 49a).

(1) Recorded in our Mishnah. (2) To the previous Mishnah where casual eating is permitted outside a *Sukkah*. (3) Who respectively say (*supra* 26a) that casual eating is two or three eggs and the bulk of an egg, the quantity a student eats before proceeding to college. (4) Before eating it. (5) After it has been eaten. (6) But not *Sukkah*, the prescribed minimum for which is either that given by R. Joseph or Abaye. (7) During the seven days of the festival. (8) *Sc.* one need not eat even one meal in the *Sukkah* if one desires to fast throughout the seven days. (9) When one must eat a meal in the *Sukkah*. (10) Which is the

PENSATION FOR THIS, AND OF THIS WAS IT SAID: THAT WHICH IS CROOKED CANNOT BE MADE STRAIGHT, AND THAT WHICH IS WANTING CANNOT BE NUMBERED.¹

GEMARA. What is the reason of R. Eliezer?—*Ye shall dwell*² implies just as you normally dwell. As in a [normal] abode [a man has] one [meal] by day and one by night, so in the *Sukkah* [he must have] one meal by day and one by night. And the Rabbis?³—[They say that the implication² is] like an abode. Just as in an abode a man eats if he desires and if he does not so desire he does not eat, so also with the *Sukkah*; if he desires he eats, and if he does not so desire he does not eat. But if so, [why should he not have the option] on the first night of the Festival also?—R. Johanan answered in the name of R. Simeon b. Jehozadak, With regard to *Sukkah* it says, *The fifteenth*,⁴ and with regard to the Festival of Passover it says, *The fifteenth*.⁵ Just as there⁶ the first night only is obligatory⁷ but from then on it is optional,⁸ so here also the first night is obligatory,⁹ but from then on it is optional. And in the case of Passover whence do we know?¹⁰—Since the verse says, *At evening ye shall eat unleavened bread*;¹¹ Scripture thus establishes it¹² as an obligation.

R. ELIEZER SAID IN ADDITION. But did not R. Eliezer say that a man is obliged to eat fourteen meals in the *Sukkah*, one on each day and one on each night?¹³—Bira answered in the name of R. Ammi, R. Eliezer recanted [of his previous statement]. With what does one make up for it?¹⁴

Eighth Day of Solemn Assembly, though on that day the obligation of *Sukkah* no longer applies. (This will be discussed in the Gemara).

(1) Eccl. I, 15. (2) Lev. XXIII, 42, dealing with the *Sukkah*. (3) THE SAGES, *sc.* how can they maintain their view against this exposition. (4) Lev. XXIII, 39. (5) *Ibid.* 6. (6) Passover. (7) For eating unleavened bread. (8) V. Pes. 120a. (9) To eat in the *Sukkah*. (10) That the obligation applies at least to the first night. (11) Ex. XII, 18. (12) Eating on the first evening. (13) And since the last day is not subject to the obligation, and any person sitting in the *Sukkah* on that day in fulfilment of the commandment is guilty of adding to the commandments, how can that day compensate for the first? (14) The meal of the first evening.

If you will say with bread,¹ is not one merely eating the [obligatory] meal of the festival day?²—The fact is that by 'make up' is meant that one should make up with various kinds of desert.³ So it has also been taught: ⁴If he made up [for a meal he has missed] with various kinds of desert he fulfilled his obligation.⁵

The major domo of King Agrippa⁶ asked R. Eliezer, [A man] such as I am, who eat but one meal a day, may I eat one meal [in the *Sukkah*] and be free [of my obligation]? He answered him, Every day you draw out [the meal] with all kinds of dainties for your own honour, and now you cannot add one dainty for the honour of your Creator? He also asked him, [A man] such as I who have two wives, one in Tiberias and one in Sepphoris, and two *Sukkahs*, one in Tiberias and one in Sepphoris, may I go from one *Sukkah* to the other and⁷ thus be free from my obligation? He answered him, No! For I say that he who goes from one *Sukkah* to another annuls the *mizwah*⁸ of the first.

It has been taught: R. Eliezer says, [27b] One may not go from one *Sukkah* to another,⁹ nor may one¹⁰ make a *Sukkah* during the Intermediate Days of the Festival, while the Sages say, One may go from one *Sukkah* to another, and one may make a *Sukkah* during the Intermediate Days of the Festival; but both of them are in accord that if it fall down, one¹¹ may re-erect it during the Intermediate Days.

What is the reason of R. Eliezer?—Scripture says, *Thou shalt keep the Feast of Sukkoth for seven days*,¹² [which implies,] make a

(1) *Sc.* one's ordinary meal. (2) How then could it also serve as compensation? (3) Which form no essential part of the usual festival meal. (4) That even desert may be regarded as a compensating meal. (5) Much more so, of course, if he did it with a proper meal of bread and meat. (6) [Agrippa II; the major domo, *epitropos*, is identified with Joseph b. Simai mentioned in *Shab.* 121b. V. Graetz, *MGWJ.* XIII 1881, p. 484 and Klein, *Beiträge* p. 66 n. 1.] (7) Though other people must use the same *Sukkah* throughout the seven days (*v. infra*). (8) The good deed performed by obeying the commandment to dwell in a *Sukkah*. (9) *Sc.* to eat in one and sleep in the other or to use one on one day and the other on the next. (10) Who did not dwell in a *Sukkah* on the first day. (11) Who fulfilled his duty in it in the earlier day or days. (12) *Deut.* XVI, 13.

Sukkah which shall be fit for seven days.¹ And the Rabbis?²—This is what the Divine Law means: Make a *Sukkah* for the Festival. 'But both of them are in accord that if it fall down one may re-erect it during the Intermediate Days'. But is not this obvious?³—I would have said that this⁴ is [deemed to be] another [*Sukkah*] and is [thus] not one for seven days, therefore he informs us [that we do not say so].⁵

It has been taught: R. Eliezer said, Just as a man cannot fulfil his obligation on the first day of the Festival⁶ with the palm-branch of his fellow, since it is written, *And ye shall take to you on the first day the fruit of goodly trees, branches of palm-trees*,⁷ i.e., from your own, so cannot a man fulfil his obligation with a *Sukkah* of his fellow, since it is written, *The festival of Sukkoth thou shalt keep to thee for seven days*.⁸ I.e., of thine own. The Sages, however, say, Although they⁹ said that a man cannot fulfil his obligation on the first day of the Festival⁶ with the palm-branch of his fellow, he may nevertheless fulfil his obligation with the *Sukkah* of his fellow, since it is written, *All that are homeborn in Israel shall dwell in Sukkoth*,¹⁰ which teaches that all Israel are able to sit in one *Sukkah*.¹¹ And how do the Rabbis¹² interpret the words 'to thee'?⁸—It is needed to exclude a stolen [*Sukkah*]; but as to a borrowed one, it is written, 'All that are homeborn' etc.¹⁰ And what does R. Eliezer do with, 'All that are homeborn'?¹⁰—It is needed [to include] a convert who had become converted in the meantime¹³ or a minor

(1) One made during the Intermediate Days is obviously for less than 'seven days' as is one that is forsaken before the seven days are over. (2) How can they maintain their view against this exposition? (3) Since the *Sukkah* was originally put up for the full seven days. (4) Since it is put up again during the Intermediate Days. (5) Because the repaired *Sukkah* is merely the continuation of the original one which was duly intended for the full seven days. (6) Of Tabernacles. (7) *Lev.* XXIII, 40. (8) This is the literal translation of *Deut.* XVI, 13 quoted *supra*. (9) The Rabbis who preceded them. (10) *Lev.* XXIII, 42. (11) Now, the contribution each Israelite could possibly make towards the cost of such a common *Sukkah* would inevitably amount to less than a *perutah* which legally acquires nothing, so that each could use the *Sukkah* only by borrowing it from the others. (12) The Sages. (13) I.e., between the first and the last days of the Festival.

who had attained his majority in the meantime.¹ And the Rabbis?²—Since they say that a man³ may make a *Sukkah* during the Intermediate Days of the Festival no [special] verse is needed [for converts and minors].⁴

Our Rabbis have taught: It once happened that R. Ilai went to pay his respects to R. Eliezer his master in Lydda⁵ on a Festival.⁶ He⁷ said to him, 'Ilai, you are not of those that rest on the Festival',⁸ for R. Eliezer used to say, 'I praise the indolent who do not emerge from their houses on the Festival⁹ since it is written, *And thou shalt rejoice, thou and thy household*'.¹⁰ But it is not so? For did not R. Isaac say, 'Whence do we know that a man is obliged to pay his respects to his teacher on the Festival? From Scripture which said, *Wherefore wilt thou go to him to-day? It is neither New Moon nor Sabbath*'¹¹ from which it follows that on the New Moon¹² and the Sabbath a man is obliged to pay his respects to his master?'¹³—There is no difficulty. The latter refers to where he can go and return [to his house] on the one day;¹⁴ the former to where he cannot go and return on the same day.¹⁵

(1) They are obliged to make for themselves a *Sukkah* in which to dwell from that time to the end of the Festival, even although an ordinary Israelite, according to R. Eliezer *supra*, must make a *Sukkah* after the Festival has begun. (2) Who use this text *supra* for another deduction, whence do they deduce the law just mentioned? (3) Even an ordinary Jew whose duty it was to make the *Sukkah* prior to the Festival. (4) Whose case may be inferred *a minori ad majus*. (5) R. Eliezer b. Hyrcanus who conducted his own academy at Lydda for many years. V. Sanh. 36b. (6) I.e., set out on the eve of the Festival in order to be with his Master on the first day of the Festival. (7) The Master. (8) *Sc.* those who spend it at home in the company of their wives. (9) Though their sole reason for staying at home is their indolence. (10) Deut. XIV, 26. This verse does not, as a matter of fact, refer to a Festival but to the second tithe. Tosaf. (Pes. 109a) suggests an analogy between this verse and Deut. XVI, 14, the import of each being the same, but the former is quoted since it mentions the word 'house' (i.e., 'wife') specifically. (11) II Kings IV, 23. The reference is to the Shunamite woman and Elisha. (12) *Sc.* a Festival. (13) V. R.H., Sonc. ed., p. 62, n. 12. Now how are the two statements to be reconciled? (14) As his wife would thus have his company for a part of the day he must also pay his respects to his teacher. (15) His duty to his wife overrides his duty to his teacher as far as a visit to him on a Festival is concerned.

Our Rabbis have taught: It happened that R. Eliezer passed the Sabbath¹ in Upper Galilee in the *Sukkah* of R. Johanan son of R. Ilai at Caesarea or, as some say, in Caesarea [Philippi],² and when the sun reached the *Sukkah* he said to him,³ 'How if I spread a cloth over it?'⁴ He answered him, 'There was not a tribe in Israel which did not produce a judge'.⁵ When the sun reached to the middle of the *Sukkah*, he said to him, 'How if I spread a cloth over it?' He answered him, 'There was not a tribe in Israel from which there did not come prophets, and the tribes of Judah and Benjamin appointed their kings at the behest of the prophets'.⁶ When the sun reached the feet of R. Eliezer,⁷ Johanan took a cloth and spread it over [the *Sukkah*]. R. Eliezer [thereupon] tied up his cloak, threw it over his back, and went out.⁸ It was not in order to evade an answer [that he answered as he did] but because he never said anything which he had not heard from his master.

How did R. Eliezer act thus?⁹ Did not R. Eliezer say, One may not go from one *Sukkah* to another?¹⁰—It was on another Festival.¹¹ But did not R. Eliezer say, I praise the indolent who do not leave their houses on the Festival?—It was an ordinary Sabbath.

But could he not deduce [the answer]¹² from his own¹³ statement, since we have learnt: One may shut a window¹⁴ with a

(1) Of Tabernacles. (2) There were two Caesareas in N. Palestine, distinguished by their spelling. (3) Johanan to R. Eliezer. (4) So as to provide more shade. The point of his question was whether the spreading of the cloth is regarded as the extension of a temporary tent which is forbidden on the Sabbath. (5) He turned to another topic, since, as explained *infra*, he never gave a decision which had not been handed down. R. Eliezer's outstanding characteristic was his rigid conservatism. (6) Saul and David, for instance, were appointed by Samuel. Cf. prev. n. (7) As the sun climbed the sky, its rays penetrated more and more into the *Sukkah*. (8) In order to avoid responsibility for Johanan's action (cf. *supra* n. 4). (9) Dwell in another person's *Sukkah* on the Festival. (10) How then could he leave his own *Sukkah* in Lydda (cf. Sanh. 32b) for that of Johanan at Caesarea? (11) Not Tabernacles. They sat in the *Sukkah* for convenience. (12) To Johanan's enquiry. (13) R. Eliezer's. (14) On the Sabbath.