Yom Kippur Sermon 5779: Im Ein Ma'aminim Hem, B'nai Ma'aminim Hem (Faith is Not Enough) Rabbi Eric Yanoff

Shanah Tovah. (G'mar Tov.)

I want to **begin today**, by asking everyone to get comfortable... *Not* because this is going to be a long, doozy of a sermon. But because I want to **ask you a question** – and I want you to focus on *your* answer to this question. Close your eyes, if you're comfortable. I want you to **think** about this *one* **question** – and I want you to know that, by my even *asking* this question, I am taking a risk, for my **job security** here at Adath Israel. So **think long and hard** – because I know that *I'VE* **thought long and hard** about whether and how I should ask this question. **Ready? Here goes** – here is the **question**:

WHY ARE YOU ALL HERE?

Why are you here? What are you doing here? This place, this day, this service, its rituals and language... I don't take your presence for granted at all – in fact, in many ways, I think it's a little crazy. It's certainly not rational, not grounded in good economics, or good logic. I mean, I don't take attendance, I don't keep score, but I do help with setting up the extra chairs here for the holidays – so I know that, if it's not amortized over a year of constant shul-going, this is a pricey ticket you're enjoying right now... like *Hamilton* pricey!

Why are you here? I mean, that's *THE* question, right? Is it just **intergenerational inertia** that drags you back here each year? It's **gotta be more** than that, doesn't it? I know I'm not really helping my case as a rabbi here by asking this, but I am amazed!

Is it the **old joke** – New Rabbi, meeting congregants for the first time, asks that same question – why do you like coming to shul; one man says, "Let me introduce you to Mr. Goldstein": "Goldstein here comes to shul to talk to God; I come to talk to Goldstein." Are you Goldstein? Or did you reserve seats to make sure you're sitting next to Goldstein? Don't get me wrong; there is a highly communal draw to this place – the word for synagogue in Hebrew is <u>not</u> Beit Tefillah, house of prayer – it's Beit Knesset – which means, loosely, the gathering-place, the water cooler, the hangout. There are a lot more people who come to talk to Goldstein than come to talk to God – so much so that we really named this place for the people who come to be with Goldstein.

I'm calling this question – because if we *cannot* come up with an answer, then we're in real trouble. And it's **risky** – because once I call this question, I *better* have an answer. But like any one of the **lawyers** in this room would advise me – I am only asking this question because it's a **question whose answer I think I know**. I think I've figured it out – THE ONE reason why we're all here. **ONE uniting impulse** that could define every one of us – the **Goldsteins, the Goldstein-Whisperers**, *all* of us.

I **stumbled** upon *my* answer accidentally – but the second it hit me, I knew I had to bring it to you all today. I was reading the newest **book** by the centrist Israeli scholar Yossi Klein HaLevi (who has been a visiting scholar here several times, most recently for the fiftieth Yom Yerushalayim). Yossi's new book is called *Letters to My Palestinian Neighbor*, and Yossi opens the book by lamenting that, nowadays, he cannot have an open conversation with the Palestinians who live just one hill over from him. There is **too much Palestinian hatred** for an Israeli like him to just walk over to his neighbor. He had done that for a previous book in the 1990s, before the Second Intifada convinced Israelis that their neighbors were not currently peace partners.... Before a half-dozen Israeli overtures of peace in the late '90s and early 2000s – withdrawal from land, offers even to negotiate Jerusalem, in the late '90s – had been rebuffed and answered with terror. Disillusioned, saddened, Yossi Klein HaLevi says to his imagined neighbor, essentially, "I **cannot visit you, we cannot talk** – so I'm writing you these ten letters – to try to **explain who I am**, and to try to reach out to understand who you are."

It's a beautiful book – and in the second letter, Yossi Klein HaLevi is explaining to his imaginary Palestinian neighbor and letter-recipient **why millions of Jews** – from secular Russians to kabbalistic Yemenites, Ultra-Orthodox extremists who do not believe that a State of Israel can exist without the Messiah, to Reform and Conservative Women of the Wall who seek a place to practice their legitimate version of Judaism – **why do we all care so much about the Kotel?** Why did we, over centuries, risk our lives, face persecution? Why do we keep at it so much? And if we're assimilated, why did we not give it *all* up, the last vestiges of our Jewish connection? Why do secular Jews, hanging on to Jewish faith by a thread, care about the Kotel? Looking at the Kotel, Yossi asks, *Why are we Jews still here?*

And then, he offers a **beautiful explanation** of why we're here He says, **[POSTERS]** Im ein ma'aminim hem, b'nei ma'aminim hem. All of us – if we ourselves are not believers, then we are the descendants of believers, part of the people of this faith.

Im ein ma'aminim hem, b'nei ma'aminim hem — If we ourselves don't believe, don't observe — we are descendants of believers. We come from this belief system, even if we are not currently doing it. Yossi Klein HaLevi was describing why Israelis are so passionate about their Jewish identity — but as I read that line, I thought to myself, Holy schwarma — that's it. That's why everyone comes here. That's what brings us back together: If not ourselves believers, then we come from it. We are part of it, descended from it.

In this room, I know: There are some people who are **deep believers**. Some people buy in. <u>These</u> are the *ma'aminim* - the believers. That word - *ma'aminim* - look in the middle of it - it has the word "*amen*" in it. "*Amen*" or "*Emunah*" means faithful acclamation. When we say "*amen*," we're saying, "We're in. We truly believe what was just said."

But *[raise MY hand]* is there **anyone in this room** who, sometimes, at least **a little bit, struggles** with whether we really believe in in certain articles of Jewish faith, or the fantastical, miraculous stories of our tradition. Have we ever heard some fanciful explanation of a Jewish law or story, and said to ourselves, "*really*?..." Have we **ever wondered** – privately or aloud – if the picture of God that Judaism paints is one we can fully say "*amen*" to?

I know <u>I</u> struggle with faith sometimes. I bet there are people in this room who live with that nagging inconsistency: We like our Judaism – *buuuut*, some of the stuff feels a little off, a little quaint, not modern. We *feel* very Jewish – *buuuut*, maybe we don't do *all 613* of the *mitzvot*. Sometimes, *other* values, *other* priorities, other realities pull us in *other* directions.

And I'm here today to say to you: **THAT'S OKAY.** Because *even if* you are in a moment of **questioning**, or a moment of **rejection** – even if you are *not* feeling like you're one of the **true ma'aminim today** – you are **certainly** one of the **b'nei ma'minim** – the descendants of it. You **come from it**. And even if you were **not born Jewish**, you are part of it – because you have **embraced this heritage**, this People... It is **still our legacy**. It is **precious** to us. If it's **not** in our **DNA**, it's certainly in our **kishkes**. The word "**b'nei**" does **not** mean **literal**, **genetic children**, here; it means **nation**, **People**. We are the **People** of the **ma'aminim**. We either **have faith** – or at least, we **come from faith** – and that **also** is enough to **connect** us. To **sustain** us. To be **meaningful** to us, **precious** to us.

And *even* if you *do* **count yourself** among the *ma'aminim*: As I reflected on the Second Day of Rosh Hashanah, sometimes just **pure belief is not enough**. Sometimes **faith is not enough**. Because *every* human experience of pain and loss, every logic-based observation of our world, *every* **modern distraction** from the **wonder** that **nurtures belief** – every bit of it **flies in the face** of pure, unquestioning belief. Sometimes we **need more than our faith**. Sometimes we need to feel like we're part of a **broad, deeply-rooted family tree**, that **connects us, embraces us,** *even* as we question. If we have doubt, or ambivalence, that can be okay – so long as it still connects

us. Novelist Jonathan Safran Foer tells the story of his six-year-old son, who asked **if Moses** was a <u>real person</u>. "I don't know," says the father, "but we're related to him."

"I don't know if Moses is real – but we're related to him." "He's **one of us**, we're **one of his** squad." Can we see ourselves *that* **close** to one another – no matter who we are, how much we believe – can we see ourselves as **related** to one another, **descendant** of one another, **even** *with* **our doubts** and divisions?

We live in such a **fractious time** – everything, **every idea**, **every affiliation**, **every word** seems only to divide us, from **within**. We also live in the first time when **very real anti-Semitism**, as an **external threat** – in Europe, in the community of nations, and rising in our own country – when this **external hatred** that **always drew us together** against a **common enemy** is having the **opposite effect**, as Jews distance ourselves from one another, **too uncomfortable with one another** to see the common threat. And **worst of all**, we live in a time when **apathy** and **indifference**, **emotional fatigue** from all the rhetoric and fighting and polemics have just **worn us down** – such that the words of Rabbi Abraham Joshua Heschel feel **ominous** and prophetic, when he warned, "**The opposite of good is not evil; the opposite of good is indifference**."

In such a world, we need a **really good reason** to be here today, to sustain this faith – because it would be **all too easy** to just be **too busy** or **too tired** or **disillusioned** or **ambivalent** to come. I could give you a **million reasons NOT to be here** today: The **cost**, other pressing business, the fact that Judaism, if we were honest with ourselves, is not THE sole, definitive source of the way we live our lives on a daily or weekly basis. And **yet, we're here**. And I believe the reason we're here can be defined by that one line: *Im ein ma'aminim hem, b'nei ma'aminim hem. If* it's **not completely** who we are, it's what we're **part of**, that **draws us back** here.

The Israel that Yossi Klein HaLevi describes - and this beautiful community I see before me today - WE, like Israel, have **among us both** ma'aminim - and people who, with our doubts and ambivalences, still see ourselves as **part of, descendant of, derivative of, the** ma'aminim.

That's what binds us together, and brings us here. Im ein ma'aminim hem, b'nei ma'aminim hem. We are Goldstein, and we come to talk to Goldstein. And we think Goldstein is meshuggeh for his Jewish beliefs, or maybe for his political beliefs, or maybe for his quirky personality – but we feel very strongly that he is OF us, he IS us. And if anyone messes with Goldstein, they are messing with us – because, like Jonathan Safran Foer's connection to Moses, we're all related, precious, dear to one another, and to this legacy.

In our b'nei ma'aminim, our People, we have cultural Jews, and traditionally-observant Jews.... We have people on the left and people on the right... We have ardent Zionists, and we have those who are intimidated by the way that Israel has become such a wedge issue, and shy away from it... We have people who are married, people who are not married, people who were married, to people of opposite gender or same gender or some other definition of gender... We have people who are married to Jewish people who are not themselves Jewish, but are here, supportive, loving, curious... We have people who are wealthy, and people who wish they could contribute more materially to our community, but who DO give their souls and their time to the spirit of this place... We have people who are in pain. I'm not sure if, in truth, we have anyone who has never experienced pain – but if so, good for you, and you're part of it too.

But wherever we are — <u>here</u>, in Israel, in Europe, or one of those last two Jews said to be in Kabul, Afghanistan — neither of whom will leave because each refuses to let the other claim the last remaining Torah scroll and the bragging rights ("I refuse to die and let that guy win!") — Wherever we are, we ALL fit this same phrase: Either we are of the faithful, or we are refusing to give up, we come back each year, because we are rooted in that faith.

But <u>now</u> – here's the **last**, and **most painful part** of that **question**, of **why we're here**: If we're **not** *ma'aminim*, if we're not all in, is that **descendancy** from that faith **strong enough?** If it's just nostalgia, the past – well, I'll tell you – *nostalgia just ain't what it used to be....*

Is it enough to be here because we come from it? Is it enough to say, "Not on my watch, I won't let this streak fade, this chain be broken" -? As your Rabbi, I can tell you: This question is what keeps me up at night. Not the question of will YOU come — but a question that cuts to the core of my Jewish insecurity, my most vulnerable, raw fear: I fear that our — ALL of our — children and grandchildren won't feel it enough to come, to see themselves, even if they doubt, even if they are not ma'aminim — Will they see themselves as b'nei ma'aminim, as part of it?

Let's have a **moment of honesty** (*not a spectator sport*): **[HANDS]** Who in this room is **afraid** of that? Who in this room is **not 100% certain** that our children and grandchildren will feel the same pull that we feel to this room, on this day? It **terrifies me**. And we have it **in common** with the **modern liberal, centrist Jews of Israel**, too – they are not certain that their children and grandchildren will feel the same pull. That, we can learn from one another – because *they* have the **people-hood** part down, but *without* the rootedness of **religion** – and **we** have the **religious** rites here, but *not* always the **peoplehood**.

How many of us **fear** an **inexorable, ongoing dilution** – such that, if we are **not** *ma'minim*, but *b'nei ma'aminim* – and then our children are *b'nei b'nei ma'aminin* – this **generational decline** will eventually **dilute us out of existence?** That's what scares me. Even as your Rabbi: I pray, I live in a way that strives to **stack the deck, tip the scales** in **favor of Jewish continuity** for my community (*I try to be an over-achiever in the whole "Jewish Continuity" thing*), my own family – but I can't give you a sure thing.

I don't mean to be a downer: I believe that we are here because we're sincere in our faith or practice, and because we wish to re-up our connection, our line, our descendancy, from that faith.... AND we're here because we are somewhere between hopeful and terrified about whether, in two generations, our descendants will feel as strongly about it as we do.

And I'll tell you, we **come by it honestly**: The historian **Szymon Rawidowicz** once called the Jews the "**Ever-Dying People**" – that in every generation, *that* generation of Jews is convinced that **we are the last** of the Jews, that it will all flicker out after we're gone, turn out the lights on your way out,... and then, **that next generation** *does* come along, does its Judaism, in its *own* way, and part of *that* generation's Judaism is to be *certain* that <u>it</u> is the last generation of Jews.

We **come by this neurosis honestly**, we **come from a long line of neuroses** – going all the way back to the third generation of the Jewish People. There is a story about **Jacob**, on his **deathbed**, gathering his sons around, convinced that they would not carry on the tradition, that it would **die with him**. Jacob, whose **other earned name is Yisrael**, is *convinced* that Judaism would be a **three-generation historical blip**, to end with him. But his **sons gather around**, and reassure their father, who is Jacob, a.k.a. Israel, by saying: "*Shema Yisrael* – **Listen, Israel, Jacob, Dad**, we get it: *Adonai Eloheinu, Adonai Echad* – we know that Adonai, alone, is our God."

Shema Yisrael, Adonai Eloheinu, Adonai Echad. To which Yisrael, Israel answers: "Baruch shem k'vod malchuto l'olam va'ed – Praise God's Name – for all time."

For all time - but why are we so insecure about lasting "for all time" - ? Maybe it's because we care about it too much to take it for granted. That's why *I'm* so amazed by your presence here – because I care so deeply about your presence here. Because I see you, each and every one of you, as the Torah teaches, as *morashah kehillat Ya'akov* – as the proud legacy of the People of Jacob, also known as Yisrael, Israel.

And *not* just a legacy of **believing**, but of **struggling**, of **ambivalence**. Do you know what Yisrael means? It means the one who **wrestles**, who **struggles** with God. Adath Israel – *Adat Yisrael* – we are the Community of strugglers. (Would be a great name for a Jewish wrestling team, if such a thing ever existed...) Even Jacob, Israel, 4000 years ago, was **struggling with faith** – even before he was **convinced that his kids wouldn't carry it on, he struggled**. He struggled, I don't know if he always believed – but I know he **came from believers** [POINT TO 2nd POSTER] – he came from Abraham and Sarah, Isaac and Rebecca.

He **reached back to the beginning** of it all, and yet he **struggled** with faith, and then he **worried** that there would be **no more faith after him**. And *yet*, there *was* that **continuity** – because **he came from it**, because *we* **come from it**. Because *even* when we are **ambivalent**, we are **part of it**, it is **part of us**, in our *kishkes*.

Isn't that what this moment of **Yizkor** is all about? Yizkor is about **remembering** who we **are**, what we **came from**. We **reach backward**, **unsure**, **seeking** some sense of **strength**, **spirit**, **legacy** from those who came before us, whom we miss so – praying that it will **empower** and **affirm** <u>our</u> **generation**, and **all generations that come** next. In this moment of Yizkor, we **position ourselves** at the <u>cusp</u> – between what <u>was</u>, what is **lost but not forgotten** – and what we pray <u>will be</u>, if we do our part by **remembering** and sustaining that legacy. Our presence here at Yizkor, it **stacks the odds** in our favor for future *b'nei ma'aminim*.

That's where we are right now: At Yizkor, we stand at the cusp of Jewish continuity – where the past meets the as-yet-undetermined future of Judaism. It's so much bigger than the Kaddish at the end: It's about standing between the past that we remember, and the future that we hope will remember us.... Part of that chain of continuity.... [REPEAT] Between the past that we remember, and the future that we hope will remember us...

So please, as we now begin Yizkor, I'll ask you to **rise** (if you are able) and **stand** in this critical space, this **crux** of **Jewish continuity, with me**. **Stand here, recalling the past**, even as we are **unsure of the future**. Stand in memory of those *ma'aminim* and *b'nei ma'minim*, and **fellow doubters** and **strugglers** and **wrestlers**, with all their contradictions and ambivalences and neuroses that we inherited from them – Stand up because **we owe them** that much, as we can **only see the future, chart the future**, if we **climb upon their shoulders**. Stand up **NOT because we owe them** some misplaced Jewish **guilt** – but because of **Jewish PRIDE**. Because of **Jewish LOVE**. Stand up – and to strengthen our resolve at this moment of Yizkor, <u>say with me</u>, say *after* me, these words that describe us all, together, in this room:

[Encourage people to stand; REPEAT THE PHRASES] I may have faith... but if not... I come from faith.... I stand here... NOT because of Jewish GUILT.... I stand here... because of Jewish PRIDE.... Because of Jewish LOVE.... Love for what has been. Love for what can still be....

Friends, Yizkor is *not* only about what has **been**. It's about what **can still be**. As we stand for Yizkor, at this **cusp between past and future**, this **crux of Jewish continuity** – I pray that **whether** as **ma'aminim**, or as **b'nei ma'aminim**, whatever we are that brings us here, we **find ourselves here** for the **right reasons**, and we **leave here poised for a future** that **honors** the **legacy** of the **loved ones** whom we **now remember**. **Keyn yehi ratzon** – So may it be God's will. And let us say: **AMEN**.